

PONTIFICAL CATHOLIC UNIVERSITY OF RIO GRANDE DO SUL
SCHOOL OF HUMANITIES
LETTERS

ARTUR DOS SANTOS LEAL

**WHEN BRAZILIAN MUSIC TOOK OVER THE USA: A PLUNGE INTO BOSSA NOVA AND
THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE VERSION OF *GAROTA DE IPANEMA***

Porto Alegre
2023

GRADUAÇÃO



Pontifícia Universidade Católica
do Rio Grande do Sul

ARTUR DOS SANTOS LEAL

**WHEN BRAZILIAN MUSIC TOOK OVER THE USA: A PLUNGE INTO BOSSA
NOVA AND THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE VERSION OF *GAROTA DE IPANEMA***

Monograph presented as a partial requirement
for obtaining a Teaching Degree in Language
Arts: English from the Language Arts: English
course at the Pontifical Catholic University of
Rio Grande do Sul.

Adviser: Arthur Beltrão Telló, PhD

Porto Alegre
2023

ARTUR DOS SANTOS LEAL

**WHEN BRAZILIAN MUSIC TOOK OVER THE USA: A PLUNGE INTO BOSSA
NOVA AND THE ENGLISH LANGUAGE VERSION OF *GAROTA DE IPANEMA***

Monograph presented as a partial requirement
for obtaining a Teaching Degree in Language
Arts: English from the Language Arts: English
course at the Pontifical Catholic University of
Rio Grande do Sul.

Approved in, 2023.

Board of examiners:

ARTHUR BELTRÃO TELLÓ, PhD – Adviser
(PUCRS)

ALINE EVERS, PhD
(PUCRS)

JULIO CARLOS MORANDI, PhD
(PUCRS)

Porto Alegre
2023

À minha mãe, que dedicou a vida à educação com paixão e excelência. Minha maior inspiração a seguir seus passos na mesma árdua, porém recompensadora arte de ensinar que agora tomo plenamente como minha.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to thank all the amazing professors from PUCRS School of Humanities whose paths crossed with mine throughout my undergraduate studies for such an outstanding work and kindness.

My special thanks to my advisor, Arthur Beltrão Telló, for sharing a little bit of his endless knowledge of all things not only in the production of this final paper but also throughout the Literature and Latin courses that had an enormous impact on me. Since then, he has inspired me to become a better teacher and a better person.

*De manhã escureço
De dia tardo
De tarde anoiteço
De noite ardo*

*A oeste a morte
Contra quem vivo
Do sul cativo
O este é meu norte*

*Outros que contem
Passo por passo:
Eu morro ontem*

*Nasço amanhã
Ando onde há espaço:
- Meu tempo é quando*

ABSTRACT

Considering the great influence that English-speaking artists have in the international music market, it is common for their successful songs to be (re)produced in other languages as mere translations or meaningless versions of the original. However, in the early 1960s, there was a cultural phenomenon in Brazil that went against this trend — Bossa Nova. After several songs of this movement had achieved success in the country, the *bossanovistas* broke the boundaries and also conquered an important space in North American and European markets. Throughout this research we could emphasize the importance of Bossa Nova as an innovative movement of Brazilian music renovation and attest that it is the Brazilian cultural manifestation that has been the most influential abroad until today. The aim of this paper is to contextualize Bossa Nova as a cultural movement from its creation to the international success, especially in the United States, and to discuss translation of singable songs within this context. To do so, we provided a literature review on translation studies of creative texts, focusing on the concept of *transcreation* by Haroldo de Campos. Further, through Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle, the English version of *Garota de Ipanema* was analyzed, as well as the different strategies used by the versionists to make this song attractive to the North American public.

Keywords: Bossa Nova; *Garota de Ipanema*; song translation; Pentathlon Principle; transcreation.

RESUMO

Considerando a grande influência que os artistas de língua inglesa têm no mercado musical internacional, é comum que suas músicas de sucesso sejam (re)produzidas em outros idiomas como meras traduções ou versões sem sentido das letras originais em inglês. No entanto, no início da década de 1960, houve um fenômeno cultural no Brasil que foi contra essa tendência — a Bossa Nova. Depois que várias músicas desse movimento fizeram sucesso no país, os bossanovistas romperam as fronteiras e também conquistaram um espaço importante nos mercados norte-americano e europeu. Ao longo desta pesquisa, pudemos enfatizar a importância da Bossa Nova como um movimento inovador de renovação da música brasileira e atestar que ela é a manifestação cultural brasileira mais influente no exterior até hoje. O objetivo desta monografia é contextualizar a Bossa Nova como um movimento cultural desde sua criação até o sucesso internacional, especialmente nos Estados Unidos, e discutir a tradução de músicas cantáveis dentro desse contexto. Para isso, fizemos uma revisão da literatura sobre estudos de tradução de textos criativos, com foco no conceito de transcrição de Haroldo de Campos. Além disso, por meio do Princípio do Pentatlo de Peter Low, a versão em inglês de *Garota de Ipanema* foi analisada, bem como as diferentes estratégias usadas pelos versionistas para tornar essa música atraente para o público norte-americano.

Palavras-chave: Bossa Nova; *Garota de Ipanema*; tradução de música; Princípio do Pentatlo; transcrição.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	INTRODUCTION	10
2	LITERATURE REVIEW	12
2.1	BOSSA NOVA.....	12
2.1.1	<i>Vinicius de Moraes</i>	13
2.1.2	<i>Antonio Carlos Jobim</i>	18
2.1.3	<i>João Gilberto</i>	19
2.2	TRANSLATION AND MUSIC	22
2.3	TRANSCREATION	23
2.4	PETER LOW’S PENTATHLON PRINCIPLE	27
3	ANALYSIS OR THE <i>TRANSCREATION OF GAROTA DE IPANEMA</i>	29
4	FINAL CONSIDERATIONS	36
	REFERENCES	39

1 INTRODUCTION

Considering the great influence that English-speaking artists have in the international music market, it is common for their successful songs to be (re)produced in other languages as mere translations or meaningless versions of the original English lyrics. Not rarely, some song versions keep the same melodic structure but are completely unfaithful to the theme, sense, and words of their original lyrics. Therefore, due to its numerous occurrences worldwide, most of the studies and works published on song translation or versioning focus on the process from the English language to other languages.

However, in the early 1960s, there was a cultural phenomenon in Brazil that went against this trend – Bossa Nova. After several songs of this movement had achieved success in the country, the *bossanovistas* broke the boundaries and conquered an important space in North American and European markets. This breakthrough was mainly due to the awards won by the 1959 French movie *Black Orpheus* directed by Marcel Camus, based on the play *Orfeu da Conceição* by Vinicius de Moraes, which had beautiful songs as its soundtrack written by Vinicius in partnership with Antonio Carlos (Tom) Jobim. Thus, Brazilian musicians such as João Donato, João Gilberto, and Tom Jobim began to perform in important jazz clubs in the United States, attracting the attention and greed of North American record companies for their music. However, the businessmen's idea was that the songs should be recorded in English for a better understanding and reception by the North American public – also considering their lack of knowledge of other languages. This process happened, but not without going through many discussions and issues with word choices between the Brazilian authors and the North American versionists hired by the record companies to americanize as much as possible the original lyrics. In the beginning, there were some mediocre outcomes, but later, the music world was presented with some great artwork like Grammy-winning albums recorded by notable North American artists, such as Stan Getz and Frank Sinatra, as well as the English language version of *Garota de Ipanema* becoming one of the most recorded and known songs in the world (Motta, 2016).

The delimitation of this monograph's theme lays on an analysis of the creation process of the English language version of *Garota de Ipanema* through Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle, featuring Bossa Nova distinctive aspects and language limitations in the translation act. To conduct this research, we pursued the following aims: 1) to describe the context of Brazil in the late 1950's in which Bossa Nova arose and its pathway to international success; 2) to examine the concept of transcreation and relate it to the creation process of the English language

version of *Garota de Ipanema*; 3) to analyze which criteria of Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle were prioritized in the production of the English language version of *Garota de Ipanema*.

Therefore, this final paper is organized as follows: Chapter 2 presents the literature review starting with Bossa Nova and a historical contextualization of the period when it began in Brazil until its international success. We also present a profile of the three artists considered as the creators of Bossa Nova: Vinicius de Moraes, Antonio Carlos Jobim, and João Gilberto. The second part of the literature review regards to Translation and Music. There is a brief historical background of translation studies relating it to music. Next, we explore the concept of *transcreation* focusing on the studies of Haroldo de Campos. Then, we explain the approach of Peter Low for singable song translation called Pentathlon Principle by detailing its five criteria for a successful outcome: singability, sense, naturalness, rhyme, and rhythm.

Chapter 3 is called *The Transcreation of Garota de Ipanema* and it features the analysis of the original song in comparison to its English version called *The Girl from Ipanema* under the prism of *transcreation* concept and the five criteria of Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle.

In Chapter 4 we present our Final Considerations, in which the discoveries and conclusions reached throughout the production of this final paper are highlighted, as well as its limitations and possible ideas for future studies.

2 LITERATURE REVIEW

In this chapter we present the ideas linked to this paper's theme that were found through bibliographical research and published academic studies on the topics of Bossa Nova, followed by Haroldo de Campos' *transcreation*, and finally Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle.

2.1 BOSSA NOVA

The cultural movement called Bossa Nova began in the end of the 1950s in the city of Rio de Janeiro. During that decade, Brazil was going through an important political change, coming out from the government of Getúlio Vargas and entering into a new government with the president Juscelino Kubitschek. It was also the time of a social and economic turnover, when a bold plan of industrialization made many people leave the countryside and reach the big cities. The construction of a new and modern federal capital brought to the people an era of big hopes and dreams, which was reinforced by the soccer national team winning its first World Cup in 1958 (Castro, 1990).

Considering Art as a means in which people express themselves and their times, Brazilian culture was also influenced by the idea of modernization. In this context, artists of all kinds gathered in bars, clubs, and in their own apartments to discuss and try new ideas of art. The music scenario was one of the most affected. Until then, samba was the most popular rhythm, but many young people thought it was becoming somehow old fashioned. They were aiming for a new sound, more modern and that could dialogue with current international influences, such as jazz and rock 'n' roll (Castro, 1990).

The process of modernization of Brazilian popular music happened with the effort of many people — composers, singers, musicians, producers — but most of them were connected somehow to one particular person: Vinicius de Moraes. It was to compose with him the songs for his play *Orfeu da Conceição* that he first gathered with Tom Jobim. The soundtrack of the play, and later of its adaptation to the movies, was the embryo of Bossa Nova. The new songs they produced after the play started to be requested by other artists. So, they decided to record an album only with their own songs, and, as both were not confident singers at that time, they chose an already renowned singer to give voice and prestige to it — Elizeth Cardoso. They also called João Gilberto, a talented but unknown guitar player, to join them in the recording. He only played the guitar in two songs of the album (*Chega de Saudade* and *Outra Vez*), but it was enough to call everyone's attention to his original and totally innovative guitar beat. After the

release of this album named *Canção do Amor Demais* in May 1958, the musical environment was struck by a feeling that something noteworthy was happening. A new way of writing, a new way of playing, a new way of singing. Definitely a new sound – a new *bossa*. The core trio Vinicius, Tom and João soon got into the spotlight. Maybe because of his previous recognition as a great poet or because of his irresistible charisma (or maybe both), Vinicius became the central pole of a new generation of artists who eagerly wanted to be part of that.

In the following sections we present the three main artists who created Bossa Nova: Vinicius de Moraes, Tom Jobim, and João Gilberto; as well as the establishment of it as a cultural movement in Brazil until the achievement of international success.

2.1.1 Vinicius de Moraes

Laetitia de Moraes says that when her brother was only a baby, he sang before he started speaking. Her brother himself confirmed in an interview that there was indeed in his family this anecdote that in his early life he used to sing a lullaby with original lyrics (something like “ê batetê, ê cabidu¹...”) before saying his first recognizable words. So, that is how life started for Vinicius de Moraes: music came before speech. Curiously, he would perform on a stage and record an album² as a singer only 50 years later. What has he done during the meantime? Well, the appropriate question should be what he has not done? And one could simply answer that he has done more for Brazilian culture than any other person. He has collected remarkable works in literature, theater, cinema and music. Not to mention that in the meantime he has accumulated a massive work as a chronicler for several journals while joining Brazilian diplomatic corps in important sites like Los Angeles, Paris and Montevideo in his “official” job as a diplomat.

Vinicius was born and raised in a middle-class family in Rio de Janeiro. His father worked in the City Hall and spent most of his free time writing Parnassian poems or playing the violin and the guitar. Coming from a family of bohemians, his mother played the piano and used to sing in the soirées at their house. Vinicius also spent a lot of time in his grandparents’ house, where his uncles Henrique and Aníbal (also known as Niboca) had a big influence on him as they also were guitar players. The latter was closer to Vinicius because they were almost the same age and he composed some songs too, having the most successful one being recorded by Carmem Miranda. So, Vinicius grew up in an environment that was culturally rich, surrounded by music and poetry (Ferraz, 2015).

¹ Ferraz, 2015, p. 285

² *Vinicius e Odete Lara*, Elenco, 1963

Clodoaldo and Lydia, Vinicius' parents, always had his education as a priority, that is why he attended classes in two of the most traditional schools of Rio de Janeiro — fundamental in Afrânio Peixoto and high school in Santo Inácio, in which he majored in Letters. During high school, he was often involved in cultural events, reading his first poems, performing in musical shows, or even acting in the school plays. He also started to sing in the school choir and formed a band with some classmates. It was at the age of 15 that he began to write songs with two of his band mates, the brothers Paulo and Haroldo Tapajós. Their first song *Loura ou Morena* was later recorded in an album in 1932 and had quite a popular success, for which he earned the first payment for copyright. Although they had written a few more songs that were also recorded, for the following two decades Vinicius would focus his efforts on writing poetry.

In the same year that he graduated from Law School, his first book of poems called *O Caminho para a distância* was published in 1933. Two years later, his second book was published by the title of *Forma e Exegese*, for which he was awarded with the Felipe d'Oliveira prize. These two first works show a young poet with a slightly raw talent who was creating under the strict influence of his catholic formation. Eucanaã Ferraz would portray this young Vinicius as a “religious and anguished poet, torn by the desire for purity and the awareness of sin”³. 1938 was a special year for Vinicius because after publishing his fourth book called *Novos poemas*, which was praised by the critics and some of his pairs (and now friends) like Manuel Bandeira and Mario de Andrade, the British Council presented him with a scholarship to study English Literature in the Magdalen College in Oxford University. So, in that same year he moved to England where he got closer to the work of William Shakespeare, raising a particular interest to study the technic of his sonnets. However, due to the burst of the World War II Vinicius was forced to shorten his stay in British lands and came back to Brazil in the end of 1939.

Already being considered at that time one of the greatest poets of his generation, Vinicius became permanent member of several groups of Brazilian intellectuals who used to meet in fancy private dinners or in traditional bohemian spots. In 1942, he accompanies the North American poet Waldo Frank in a journey through the suburbs of Rio de Janeiro and the North and Northeast of Brazil. Vinicius said that this trip changed his life perspective, because he could witness the Brazilian social reality. It was crucial not only to get the man closer to a political view towards the people's social issues but also to make the poet closer to themes of ordinary life. Touched by that feeling, he started to write the theater play *Orfeu da Conceição*,

³ [...] religioso, angustiado, dilacerado pela ânsia de pureza e pela consciência do pecado (Ferraz, 2015, p. 301). Translated by the author.

an adaptation of the Greek myth of Orpheus set in a *favela* of Rio de Janeiro during carnival time. The echoes of the journey can also be seen on the poems of his fifth book called *Cinco elegias* published in the following year. His poetry then was closer to the ground, dealing with themes related to everyday experiences. Besides that, it was the same period that he joined the Brazilian diplomatic corps, function that he would accumulate for the next 25 years.

It is with the book *Poemas, sonetos e baladas* that Vinicius reaches his maturity as a poet in 1946.⁴ He was then not only close friends with the greatest Brazilian poets Manuel Bandeira, Carlos Drummond de Andrade, and João Cabral de Melo Neto, but also was being raised onto the same shelf among them due to the quality of his work. Bandeira observed that the evolution that had been taking place in Vinicius's poetry “presented us with a creative force that was unprecedented in our literature”⁵. He went further, stating that Vinicius had “the breath of the Romantics, the spirituality of the Symbolists, the skill of the Parnassians and finally, a man of his time, the freedom, license and splendid cynicism of the modernists”. In 1947, Sérgio Milliet wrote a review saying that he considered Vinicius “the last and most brilliant of the poets of orthodox modernism”⁶. According to Antonio Candido, also a close friend of Vinicius, he was “a poet integrated into the flow of his current, because he was willing to update tradition. This was possible due to the excellence which he mastered the verse, playing with practically all its possibilities”⁷.

In 1954, after he had published the first edition of his *Antologia poética*, Vinicius had a spiritual crisis, as he would confess: “I took that book in my hands and felt that everything I did after would be just repetition”⁸. He was looking for a new way to express his emotions that could dialogue with a broader audience in a more democratic and popular way. It was this poet who couldn't fit inside himself that Brazilian poetry gave as a gift to the music.

Vinicius was designated in 1946 for his first position abroad as a diplomat in Los Angeles, where he stayed for five years. During this time, he enhanced his knowledge about the cinema world straight from the source, studying with Orson Welles and Gregg Toland. Of course that they also have become close friends. However, when Vinicius was not attending any official appointment or having parties with Hollywood stars, he would often travel to New Orleans or New York to attend jazz shows *in loco*. So, in a short time he became acquainted of several jazz musicians and record executives.

⁴ Ferraz, 2015.

⁵ Wisnik, 2008, p. 143.

⁶ Milliet, 2008, p. 153.

⁷ Candido, 2008, p. 160.

⁸ Castello, 2015, p. 283.

While living in Paris, where Vinicius had a position in the Brazilian embassy, he finished writing the script of *Orfeu da Conceição*, which was awarded in the theater contest of the Fourth Centenary of the city of São Paulo in 1954. Associated to the French cinema producer Sacha Gordine, Vinicius and his partner came to Brazil looking for financial support to make a movie from the play script, but nobody was interested in investing in it. So, Gordine went back to Paris and started producing the movie with French money, and Vinicius started producing the theater play in Brazil. Later, he was engaged in finding a musician to create with him the songs for the show. It was at the bar Villarino in the downtown of Rio de Janeiro that the journalist Lucio Rangel, a friend of Vinicius, introduced him to a young pianist called Antonio Carlos Jobim, who used to play in night clubs and make musical arrangements for record companies. Vinicius presented to him the project of the play and what he had in mind for the musical part. Tom accepted the proposal and they started to work together right away. Within the following two weeks they had all the songs done. The play premiered in September of 1956 at the Municipal Theater of Rio de Janeiro with the direction by Leo Jusi, scenery by Oscar Niemeyer, and musical conducting by Leo Peracchi. And the most remarkable feature of the play was the cast composed only by black actors, indisputably something exceptional and unlikely for the time. An album with the soundtrack of the play was released in the same year, having the arrangements by Tom Jobim, vocals by Roberto Paiva, and guitar by Luis Bonfá. The most successful songs were *Se todos fossem iguais a você* e *Lamento no Morro*. There was also a track in which Vinicius read the *Monólogo de Orfeu* from the play script. (Cabral, 1997)

Regarding the adaption of the play to the movies, the producer Sacha Gordine raised the money to start the production, but he considered that the synopsis written by Vinicius was not as commercially attractive as he wished. So, he hired the French screenwriter Jacques Viot to make some adaptations to the original text. Vinicius didn't like the result and was totally against that, because all the changes were to emphasize an exotic view from Brazil, including several stereotypes that were not necessary to tell the story. Besides that, the director Marcel Camus asked Vinicius and Tom for some new songs to include in the movie soundtrack. The problem was that he also interfered in the creation of the original lyrics, asking for the change of some words, and forcing the insertion of some verses by his own. The Brazilian authors got really mad with the situation, and almost withdrew from the movie production. Vinicius refused to sign the final version of the screenplay, but the songs were finished adding the French men as coauthors.

The movie was released in 1959 by the original title *Orfeu Negro* as a French-Italian production. It was an enormous success among the audience and critics having won 18

international awards, including the Palm d'Or at the 1959 Cannes Film Festival, and the 1960 Best Foreign Film by the Academy Award and by the Golden Globe Award. As well as the theater play, the main cast of the movie was composed by black actors, fact that would have a huge impact worldwide, but particularly in the United States that was facing terrible social issues due to the racial segregation system. To illustrate the range of the movie the great artist Jean-Michel Basquiat included *Black Orpheus* among his childhood music influences and the former president Barack Obama mentioned in his autobiography that he had watched the movie with his mother, and it taught him to embrace his black identity when he was young.

The transition of Vinicius from traditional poetry to popular music happened naturally. The togetherness with Manuel Bandeira brought him closer not only to the everyday world poetry, but also to the world of popular music. Vinicius didn't distinguish the book poetry from the song poetry:

No, I don't separate things so didactically, the poet of the book and the poet of music. Naturally, the song imposed itself on me. I've practiced it since I was a boy. There was a time when writing was an aristocratic attitude. So, I had a very strong prejudice against the song. I thought it was a minor art. But later, the knowledge of things showed me that this was a lot of nonsense. Some of the greatest poets in the English language are ancient troubadours, those minstrels. That's why I don't separate my book poetry from my song poetry at all (Moraes, 1973 *apud* Ferraz, 2015, p. 310).⁹

Vinicius brought a previously unknown prestige to the figure of the lyricist. He carried along the extensive technical repertoire of an experienced poet not to make popular song more erudite, but to reconnect it with the simplicity of its oral roots.¹⁰ According to Homem & De La Rosa¹¹, Vinicius was unanimous among his partners because he would have been the lyricist who fitted the words together most perfectly, or even better, thanks to his musicality combined with his skill with words, he discovered the exact syllable for each musical note, as if translating the sound it required. Thanks to this multiple spirit, he adapted to all generations and all styles. Due to his generosity, he created a sort of tradition to establish new friendships through song partnerships. That is why he didn't resign himself to Bossa Nova and had multiple song partners throughout his life, from his idols Pixinguinha and Ary Barroso, to a new generation of musicians like Edu Lobo and Chico Buarque.

⁹ Não, eu não separo as coisas tão didaticamente assim, o poeta do livro e o poeta da música. Naturalmente, a canção se impôs a mim. Desde menino que a pratico. Houve uma época em que escrever era uma atitude aristocrática. Então eu tinha um preconceito muito forte contra a canção. Achava uma arte menor. Mas depois, o conhecimento das coisas me mostrou que isso era uma tremenda bobagem. Os maiores poetas da língua inglesa, alguns são trovadores antigos, aqueles menestrelis. Por isso não separo em absoluto minha poesia de livro da minha poesia de canção. (Moraes *apud* Ferraz, 2015, p. 310). Translated by the author.

¹⁰ Costa e Silva, 2015.

¹¹ Homem; De La Rosa, 2013.

2.1.2 Antonio Carlos Jobim

Tom Jobim was 29 years old when he received the invitation from Vinicius that would change his life. To provide for his wife and son and afford the apartment rent he spent the days working as an arranger for the record company Odeon and the nights playing the piano at clubs. In the meantime, he was frequently seen drinking beer at bars carrying along an inseparable file full of musical scores. Besides that, Tom already had some of his compositions recorded, including a hit called *Teresa da Praia*, which was a partnership with Billy Blanco¹². In 1956, the same year of the play *Orfeu da Conceição*, Tom was awarded as the best arranger for small band and for that was promoted to the position of artistic director at Odeon. So, his name was gaining more and more respect from critics, musicians, and performers.¹³

Having been raised between the neighborhoods of Ipanema and Copacabana in a time when the South Zone of Rio de Janeiro was not yet urbanized, Tom grew up surrounded by nature and beach. Themes that would be recurrent on his songs and even would forge his lifestyle resulting further in an environmental activism. Tom started practicing the piano at the age of 13, having been supported by his stepfather who hired outstanding professors such as the German Joachim Koellreuter and Lúcia Branco. Influenced by them, Tom had an erudite musical formation, that was later expanded by professors Paulo Silva, Tomás Terán, and Léo Peracchi, who approached him from the greatest composers, especially Heitor Villa-Lobos and the French impressionist Claude Debussy (Severiano, 2008).

All this musical background made Tom ascend one step above his peers. As stated by Severiano¹⁴ this superiority can be seen in the quality of his finely crafted melodies and the boldness of his harmonization. But at the same time, Tom's musical consciousness worked in an innovative attempt to simplify the arrangements, characterized by an economy of musical notes resulting in a clear and touching texture¹⁵. Sergio Cabral¹⁶ opens his biography of Tom Jobim affirming that he was not only a magnificent creator, but also an innovator who traced the best course for Brazilian popular music from the 1950s onwards. In the back cover of the

¹² Severiano, 2008.

¹³ Homem; Oliveira, 2012.

¹⁴ Severiano, 2008.

¹⁵ Homem; Oliveira, 2012.

¹⁶ Cabral, 1997.

album *Canção do Amor Demais* Vinicius de Moraes wrote a presentation text in which he emphasized the great talent of his partner:

The grace and originality of Jobim's arrangements are nothing new anymore for me to talk about here. But I would like to draw attention to the growing simplicity and organicity of his melodies and harmonies. This shows the intelligence of his sensibility, attentive to the dilemmas of his time, and the constructiveness of his spirit, focused on permanent values in human relations¹⁷ (Moraes, 1958).

2.1.3 João Gilberto

Many people believe that João Gilberto was the main reason for the emergence of Bossa Nova, that he was the actual genius behind the revitalization of Brazilian music in the end of the 1950's. Tom Jobim is among them, as he confessed that “if it weren't for João, Bossa Nova would never have existed”.¹⁸ Indeed, his new guitar beat present in two tracks of the groundbreaking album *Canção do Amor Demais* was something revolutionary. But some critics believe that in this record we did not have yet the full package of what would be the Bossa Nova style — it was missing the new way of singing. Elizeth Cardoso was one of the greatest Brazilian stars when she was chosen to be “the voice” of Tom and Vinicius' songs, but her way of singing was similar to most of the other singers of *samba-canção*: too much power and vibratos. João believed that a lower voice, rather spoken than shouted would fit better to his guitar beat. On the album rehearsals, he tried to persuade Elizeth to adapt her way of singing, but she preferred to keep her style.

Unsatisfied with the recording outcomes, João wanted to record a solo album with his guitar beat and his own voice. Tom Jobim, who worked as a musical arranger for the record label Odeon, convinced his superiors to record a 78-rpm album for João with the songs *Chega de Saudade*¹⁹ and *Bim bom*.²⁰ Another innovation took place during the recordings: João requested two microphones, one for the guitar and another for the voice. It was something quite unusual for the time, when the recording of the voice was the most important thing. But for

¹⁷ A graça e a originalidade dos arranjos de Antonio Carlos Jobim não constituem mais novidade, para que eu volte a falar deles aqui. Mas gostaria de chamar a atenção para a crescente simplicidade e organicidade de suas melodias e harmonias [...]. O que mostra a inteligência de sua sensibilidade, atenta aos dilemas do seu tempo, e a construtividade do seu espírito, voltado para os valores permanentes na relação humana. (Moraes, 1958). Translated by the author.

¹⁸ Severiano, 2008.

¹⁹ By Tom Jobim and Vinicius de Moraes.

²⁰ By João Gilberto.

João both the voice and the sound of the guitar were relevant. After uncountable studio hours, retakes, changes in the musical arrangements, arguments between everybody else and João — who wanted everything to sound exactly like it was on his perfectionist mind — the album was released in August 1958. It was just three months later than *Canção do Amor Demais*, but at this time there were the fundamental features of Bossa Nova: the lyrics of Vinicius de Moraes, the music of Tom Jobim, and the guitar and the voice of João Gilberto. Now the revolution was on and there was no way back (Castro, 1990).

In the following year, João recorded another 78-rpm album with the songs *Desafinado*²¹ and *Ho-ba-la-lá*.²² Considering the success of both records, the directors of Odeon decided to give a chance for João to record a long play. So, in 1959, the first full album of João Gilberto was released with the title of the already most known song *Chega de Saudade*. By the same record label, he released other two albums in the following two years: *O amor, o sorriso e a flor* (1960) and *João Gilberto* (1961). In the words of Severiano²³, this trilogy recorded by Odeon constitutes “the most enlightening document ever made about bossa nova; everything important that has been written or said about it is shown there and recorded in the interpretation of the 36 songs presented by João”. Since then, the roll of artists that have declared to be decisively influenced by him is endless and counting not only with *bossanovistas* such as Carlos Lyra and Roberto Menescal, but with almost every star of Brazilian popular music (MPB²⁴) like Caetano Veloso, Gilberto Gil, Edu Lobo, and Chico Buarque.

However, until he reached the status of Bossa Nova genius, João struggled a lot on his path. He was born in Bahia in 1931 and moved to Rio de Janeiro in 1950 pursuing a career as a crooner. At the time he used to sing with a loud and powerful voice like his idol Orlando Silva and participated in some groups as a singer (without the guitar) but did not achieve success. In 1955, invited by his friend Luiz Telles, he decided to take a break from the hard time he was having in Rio de Janeiro and spend a season in Porto Alegre, which was extended to a journey for the following two years passing by Diamantina, his hometown Juazeiro, and Salvador. It was a period of inner reflection in which João chose to take the present feeling of failure and make it into a new career beginning. For that, he became obsessed with finding a new sound from his guitar, something that existed only inside his mind and was different from everything

²¹ By Tom Jobim and Newton Mendonça.

²² By João Gilberto.

²³ Severiano, 2008, p. 332.

²⁴ *Música Popular Brasileira*.

that has been done until then. Castro described this period when he began to play the guitar day and night locked in his bedroom as follows:

At first, nothing he played made much sense: the same chord was repeated a zillion times, in almost perfect duplicates, except when he added his voice. He discovered that the acoustics in the bathroom were ideal for listening to himself and his guitar. All those tiles, seeped for years with humidity and steam, formed a kind of echo chamber - the strings reverberated, and he could measure their intensity. If he sang lower, without vibrato, he could advance or delay at will, creating his own tempo. To do this, he would have to change the way he spoke, using his nose more than his mouth²⁵ (Castro, 1990, p. 146).

So, a new João Gilberto was reborn from those experiences, and when he eventually got back to Rio de Janeiro and recorded *Chega de Saudade*, it was a complete catharsis. Several musicians began to study and tried to reproduce the same revolutionary sound from João's guitar that was coined as "the João Gilberto beat" and later "the Bossa Nova beat". In his latest biography released in Brazil in 2021, the author Zuza Homem de Mello, who was one of João's closest friend, highlighted some features of João's voice that made him a remarkable singer too:

Listening to João Gilberto was a pleasure for discerning ears. The same rigor with his vocal emission as when he sang was noticeable in the phone calls during the night. Not a vowel or consonant was missed. It wasn't that João sang as he spoke: he also spoke as he sang, he articulated every word with perfect diction, without shouting, you didn't miss a word he said²⁶ (Mello, 2021, p. 16).

In the following section, the literature review of translation and music will be explored, emphasizing the *transcreation* concept of Haroldo de Campos and further Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle.

²⁵ No princípio, nada que tocava fazia muito sentido: o mesmo acorde era repetido um zilhão de vezes, em duplicatas quase perfeitas, exceto quando ele lhes acrescentava a sua voz. Descobriu que a acústica do banheiro era ideal para ouvir a si próprio e ao violão. Todos aqueles ladrilhos e azulejos, infiltrados havia anos de umidade e vapor, formavam uma espécie de câmara de eco — as cordas reverberavam e ele podia medir sua intensidade. Se cantasse mais baixo, sem vibrato, poderia adiantar-se ou atrasar-se à vontade, criando o seu próprio tempo. Para isso, teria de mudar a maneira de emitir, usando mais o nariz do que a boca (Castro, 1990, p. 146). Translated by the author.

²⁶ Ouvir João Gilberto era um prazer para ouvidos exigentes. O mesmo rigor com a emissão vocal de quando cantava se percebia nos telefonemas de madrugada. Não se perdia uma vogal ou consoante. Não era só que João cantava como falava: ele também falava como cantava, articulava cada palavra com dicção perfeita, sem gritar, não se perdia nada do que dizia (Mello, 2021, p. 16). Translated by the author.

2.2 TRANSLATION AND MUSIC

In 1835, the American poet Henry Wadsworth Longfellow claimed that “music is the universal language of mankind”. Although some strict linguists may have reasons to disagree with him, Harvard University scientists published in 2019 the most comprehensive study on music as a cultural product which shows that music carries a set of unique codes and patterns that are in fact universally understood. To carry out the five-year research, the team examined ethnographic data and gathered over a century’s worth of music from across 315 different cultures – music appeared in every society observed. They found that, across societies, music is associated with behaviors such as infant care, healing, dance, and love (The Harvard Gazette, 2019).

Considering the global village that the world has become, cultural exchanges are more likely to happen in our daily lives. In this context, translation plays a significant role to a multicultural society aiming to facilitate and bridge the differences among languages and cultures.

Until quite recently, the translation of songs did not attract much attention within translation studies. One reason might be the lack of clarity as to the professional identity of the people who do translate songs (Franzon, 2008). The professional who is going to face the task to translate a song to be sung must have knowledge not only in the field of translation but also in musicology. Susan-Sarajeva (2008) explains that there are several purposes linked to translation and music: musical movies, international musicals for local theater plays, or translating popular songs for singable versions. On other hand, Low (2005) has addressed the fact that lyrics may also be translated for non-singing purposes; and that in cases where they are going to be sung, ways of matching music and lyrics must be prioritized differently.

As in this study we are going to address singable song translations, it is important to state that, according to Franzon (2008), singability is a term that can refer mainly to phonetic suitability of the translation lyrics, making the words easy to sing to particular note values. The author also defines a song as “a piece of music and lyrics – in which one has been adapted to the other – designed for a singing performance”. Regarding the task of song translation, Franzon (2008) defends that the translator has five options: leaving the song untranslated; translating the lyrics but not taking the music into account; writing new lyrics to the original music with no overt relation to the original lyrics; translating the lyrics and adapting the music accordingly; and adapting the translation to the original music.

2.3 TRANSCREATION

Haroldo de Campos was a Brazilian poet, essayist, and translator who has dedicated his time to the studies of poetry translation since the 1950s. Working alone or with his partners Augusto de Campos (his brother) and Décio Pignatari, he has translated to Portuguese several works of great authors such as Dante, Homero, and Mayakovski. He also contributed decisively to the innovation of translation studies publishing some essays that became international reference to the area (Campos, 2011).

Definitely, Campos was not in favor of the traditional conception of the impossibility of poetry translation, especially related to the idea of an “absolute sentence” mentioned by Albrecht Fabri, for whom the possibility of translation would always arise from the deficiency of the sentence. Or from Max Bense’s hypothesis that this impossibility stems from the fragility of aesthetic information, which is inseparable from its singular realization²⁷. As a solution, Campos brought the possibility of the “re-creation” of poetic texts. Regarding the aesthetic information when “reproposed” in another language, he introduced the concept of isomorphism: “original and translation, autonomous as aesthetic information, will be linked to each other by a relationship of isomorphy; they will be different as language, but, like isomorphous bodies, they will crystallize within the same system”²⁸. Inside the recreation process, another traditional thought about translation would turn into its opposite — the more fraught with difficulties this text is, the more it can be recreated, the more seductive it is as an open possibility for recreation. There was then an idea of “creative translation”, where the condition of possibility was based on the criterion of difficulty (Campos, 2011).

Through his theoretical essays that seek to reinvent poetry translation, Campos set out a new proposal for a translation method known as *transcreation*²⁹. It goes against some scholars’ ideas of literal or word-by-word translation. On the contrary, this method is seen as a critical reading of the text to be translated. In *transcreation*, the translation is not entirely linked to the semantic value that the artistic work possesses, but mainly to the musicality and form that it may contain. Therefore, the focus of translation is not only on reconstituting the message (semantic value), but on reconstituting the system of signs in which the message of aesthetic information is incorporated³⁰. So, Campos demystifies the canonical concept that translating

²⁷ Campos, 2011.

²⁸ Campos, 2011, p. 16.

²⁹ Campos, 2011.

³⁰ Guerini; Costa; Homem de Mello, 2019.

means passing on a message from one language to another, beyond that, he makes the act of translation to be seen as an act of critical reading and creation.

Haroldo de Campos dialogued with some of his foreign pairs on translation studies of creative texts, such as Roman Jakobson, Walter Benjamin, and Ezra Pound, to reach the concept of *transcreation*. Campos³¹ recognizes the latter as the ultimate example of translator-creator and confessed that he was a huge influence on his work as a *transcreator*. Pound³² defended on his book *Literary Essays* the idea of “criticism by translation”. He followed the motto “make it new” in his translation works where we can find some intentional mistranslations that are capable to add new effects out of the source text, but loyal to its images.

Roman Jakobson also presented a similar idea to Campos’ transcreation with his concept of “creative transposition” referring to poetry translation: “the pun, or, to use a more erudite and perhaps more precise term, paronomasia, reigns over poetic art; and whether its rule is absolute or limited, poetry by definition is untranslatable. Only creative transposition is possible”. (Jakobson, 1971 *apud* Campos, 2011, p. 20)

Relating the ideas from Walter Benjamin presented in the essay *The Translator’s Task*, Campos highlights the German author’s thoughts: “Liberate that pure language in his own, which is displaced in the foreign language; liberate, through “transpoetization” (Umdichtung), that language which is captive (gefangene) in the work, that is the translator’s task.”³³ (Benjamin, 1980 *apud* Campos, 2011, p. 24)

Campos also elaborated on how Benjamin approached the dilemma between fidelity and liberty in translation:

Correlatively, the task of fidelity (die Aufgabe der treue) consists of emancipating the translator from the concern with the transmission of mere referential content; the translation’s claim to freedom is transposed to a higher plane, that of rescue (Erlösung). [...] This is why Benjamin can say, despite the apparent paradox, that translation, “according to its essence”, does not set out to merely “resemble” (Ähnlichkeit) the original, since the original itself, considered from the point of view of its “perviving” (Fortleben), is mutable, involving the ideas of “transformation” (Wandlung) and “renewal” (Erneuerung)³⁴ (Campos, 2011, p. 24 and 28).

³¹ Campos, 2013.

³² Pound, 1954 *apud* Campos, 2013.

³³ Libertar na sua própria aquela língua pura, que está desterrada na língua estranha; liberar, através da “transpoetização” (Umdichtung), aquela língua que está cativa (gefangene) na obra, eis a tarefa do tradutor (Benjamin, 1980 *apud* Campos, 2011, p. 24). Translated by the author.

³⁴ Correlatamente, a tarefa da fidelidade (die Aufgabe der treue) consiste em emancipar o tradutor da preocupação com a transmissão do mero conteúdo referencial; a reivindicação de liberdade da tradução transpõe-se para um plano mais alto, o do resgate (Erlösung). [...] Por isto Benjamin pode afirmar, a despeito do aparente paradoxo, que a tradução, “segundo sua essência”, não se propõe à mera “assemelhação” (Ähnlichkeit) com relação ao original, uma vez que o próprio original, considerado do ponto de vista de seu “perviver” (Fortleben), é mutável,

The texts approached by *transcreation* are generally related to artistic works, such as the poem and song lyrics. Campos³⁵ observed that Paulo Rónai had already mentioned in his book *Escola de Tradutores* that translation would be a kind of art considering the theoretical impossibility of literary translation: “Isn't the goal of all art something impossible? The poet expresses (or wants to express) the inexpressible, the painter reproduces the irreproducible, the statuary fixes the unfixable. It's not surprising, then, that the translator strives to translate the untranslatable”³⁶. Considering this way of thinking, Campos concludes that the translation of creative texts will always be re-creation, or parallel creation, autonomous but reciprocal (Campos, 2013).

Haroldo de Campos and his *transcreation* concept have been reference for several other authors, essayists, and translators. Leonardo Antunes shares his belief that every creation is necessarily a recreation of things that already existed before. He uses the term *aesthetic derivation* to imply an idea as “the translation and creation of literature that seeks not simply to emulate a past aesthetic, but also to give continuity with it, in a premeditated and critical way”³⁷. He also observes that since old times it was common the adaptation of creative works from one culture to another. To exemplify it, he mentions that the Latin playwright Plautus adapted and changed the name of the play *Karchedónios* in Greek to *Poenulus* in Latin to suit it to the writing characters (graphemes), references and humor of the Romans. So, the play is at the same time a translation of a Greek work but also an original work by Plautus. And he affirms that “in contemporary terms, we could say that it is a domestication translation or a transcreation”³⁸. Going further in this analysis he confirms that in the past there was an attitude in which the translator was expected to be an author. He says:

Until the 19th century, it was no surprise to anyone that people translated voluntarily modifying the content of the text. I'm not talking about the changes that necessarily occur trying to translate a text as "faithfully" as possible, with all the problems that this implies. The 20th century brought a variety of theories and nomenclatures to deal pejoratively with this process, which dates back to antiquity, and which already gave the translator a freedom that would only begin to be recovered in the second half of the 20th century with Haroldo de Campos and Meschonnic³⁹ (Antunes, 2021, p. 94).

envolve as ideias de “transformação” (Wandlung) e “renovação” (Erneuerung) (Campos, 2011, p. 24 and 28). Translated by the author.

³⁵ Campos, 2013.

³⁶ Rónai, 1952 *apud* Campos, 2013.

³⁷ Antunes, 2021, p. 91.

³⁸ Antunes, 2021, p. 94.

³⁹ Até o século XIX, não causava espanto a ninguém que se traduzisse modificando voluntariamente o conteúdo do texto. Aqui não falo das mudanças que necessariamente ocorrem mesmo quando se tenta verter um texto da

Embedded in the same scope of the innovative work made by Ezra Pound and Haroldo de Campos, the young Brazilian authors Guilherme Gontijo Flores and Rodrigo Tadeu Gonçalves published in 2017 a remarkable book called *Algo Infel* that approaches the translation act as a performance. In the introduction chapter, it is announced that the translation theory developed throughout the book is in the order of perspectivism, that is, “what would change in the translation would not be what is enunciated, but the enunciation; what changes in translation is not what is said, but the world in which it is said”. Flores and Gonçalves⁴⁰ related the function of translation with its etymology, which is to take something beyond, to cross, to lead to the other side. Based on this ideal, the authors wander through the subject passing by the translation of the God’s voice from Hebraic and Aramaic to the Hellenic language in the Bible and presenting us with a really interesting *transcreation* of Edgar Allen Poe’s poem *The Raven* entitled *O Urubu*.

The multi-skilled artist Claudio Botelho has worked in the adaptation of several musical plays from English to Portuguese in Brazil. On this task for many years, he has mastered the art of creating versions of songs for more than 30 shows. Considering the lack of clarity about the characteristics of the professional in charge of translating singable songs, Botelho⁴¹ believes that the versionist is a composer/lyricist capable of putting into other language the meaning of a given lyrics from a different source. However, he adverts to the importance of having a certain experience as a poet or composer. Because according to him, to accomplish this task properly, much more important than knowing languages is being an artist of music and verse. He also attributes his success as a versionist to the fact that he has written his own songs since a young age, being influenced by the greatest Brazilian lyricists such as Noel Rosa, Chico Buarque, and, of course, Vinicius de Moraes. Concerning the dilemma of prioritizing the lyrics or the music when translating a singable song, Botelho affirms that the music is sovereign: “lyrics must always fit in the music, as if they were originally written for that song, otherwise the game is wrong”.⁴² Further on the topic, he says that the important thing is that the audience doesn't realize they are listening to a translation. To do so, the version must carry on the emotions from

forma mais “fiel” possível, com tudo que há de problemático nessa acepção. Falo de uma postura em que já se espera de antemão que o tradutor seja autor. O século XX trouxe uma variedade de teorias e nomenclaturas para lidar pejorativamente com esse processo, que data desde a antiguidade e que já conferia ao tradutor uma liberdade que só vai começar a ser recuperada na segunda metade do século XX com Haroldo de Campos e Meschonnic. (Antunes, 2021, p. 94) Translated by the author.

⁴⁰ Flores; Gonçalves, 2017.

⁴¹ Botelho, 2013.

⁴² Botelho, 2013.

the original — “the magic really is the audience to laugh when the song is funny, to be moved by poignant songs, just like it should be in the original” (Botelho, 2013, p.146).

In the next section we present the Pentathlon Principle created by Peter Low, which is one of the most accepted theories in singable song translation studies.

2.4 PETER LOW’S PENTATHLON PRINCIPLE

Pentathlon is one of the most traditional Olympic competitions, which its modern version comprises five different disciplines: swimming, fencing, horse riding, pistol shooting and running⁴³. The winner is the athlete who has the best average performance considering all of them. So, they cannot ignore any modality, but may focus in the one they perform better in order to compensate any flaws in the others. That is the analogy that the researcher and professor Peter Low from New Zealand proposed comparing a pentathlete with a translator facing the task to translate a song. They have five criteria to follow, and a proper outcome would depend on how well they were balanced throughout the process of translation. In Low’s Pentathlon Principle of song translation, the five aspects related to music and performance are: singability, sense, naturalness, rhyme, and rhythm (Low, 2003).

Low⁴⁴ adverts that, although the criterion of singability is pragmatic, it must receive top priority in translation of singable songs, considering the target text’s specific purpose. He relates it to the notion of effectiveness on stage in drama translations to infer that singable translations require performability: “it must function effectively as an oral text delivered at performance speed — whereas the reader of a written text has a chance to pause, reflect, and even re-read it”⁴⁵. The criterion of sense is related to the issue of rendering the meaning of the original lyrics. According to Low⁴⁶, in opposite of translation of informative texts where semantic accuracy is extremely important, the constraints of song translation call for some stretching or manipulation of sense. In order to do that, the translator may replace a precise lexical equivalent by a near-synonym, or a particular metaphor by another one which conveys the same meaning. However, when it concerns to translating without carrying any fidelity to sense of the original lyrics, the author has a strict opinion:

⁴³ IOC, 2023.

⁴⁴ Low, 2003.

⁴⁵ Low, 2003, p. 93.

⁴⁶ Low, 2003.

This matter of sense still deserves high ranking, however, simply because we are talking about translation – interlingual translation. I note in passing that some people ignore sense altogether: they take a foreign song-tune and devise for it a set of target language words which match the music very well but bear no semantic relation with the source text. While this may at times be good and appropriate, it is not translating, because none of the original verbal meaning is transmitted (Low, 2005, p. 194).

The criterion that a target language text must sound natural is crucial in song translation because a song text must communicate effectively on first encounter. About naturalness, Low claims that a singable translation is not worth making unless it is understood by the audience while the song is sung. Regarding the criterion of rhyme, even though there are situations in which the source text is full of rhymes, Low explains that the translator has the option to keep it or not in cases it can be lost without cost. Within the Pentathlon principle, the translator can be adaptable to the use of rhymes:

I will have some rhyme. But I will seek some margin of flexibility. In this case the rhymes will not have to be as perfect or as numerous as in the original, and the rhyming scheme need not to be observed strictly. I will try to get a top score, but not at a great cost to other considerations, such as meaning (Low, 2003, p. 96).

The fifth and last criterion suggested by Low is rhythm, which leans on the problem of the number of syllables. Rendering the same number of syllables in lines is desirable, but not essential. As reported by Low⁴⁷, it is acceptable for the translator to add or omit a syllable in certain places without destroying the melody. However, even small changes to the melody are not out of question in favor of semantic meaning or natural word order. In cases where there may be too few syllables in a draft translation, Low proposes the translator to choose between adding a new word or phrase, repeating a word or phrase, or dropping notes from the original music. He prefers the first option, but warning that any words added must give the appearance of coming from the subtext of the original (Low, 2003).

Finally, the author emphasizes that a translator who aims to work according to the pentathlon principle will attempt to score highly in the overall effect of the text and may allow slight deviations within each criterion to accomplish it. Low concludes that there is a greater chance of successful translation if there are margins of compromise allowed (Low, 2003).

In the next chapter, we analyze the English version of the song *Garota de Ipanema*, called *The Girl from Ipanema*, looking to it through the lens of Haroldo de Campos' *transcreation* concept and considering the five criteria for singable song translation of Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle, emphasizing the criteria of sense and singability.

⁴⁷ Low, 2003.

3 ANALYSIS OF THE *TRANSCREATION* OF *GAROTA DE IPANEMA*

In this chapter we are going to analyze the English version of the song *Garota de Ipanema*, translated as *The Girl from Ipanema*, based on the studies of Haroldo de Campos about translation of creative texts, especially the concept of transcreation. At the same time, the choices made by the versionists are going to be detailed considering Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle, emphasizing the criteria of sense and singability, which are directly related to the aims of this final paper.

We present below a table containing the original lyrics of *Garota de Ipanema* by Vinicius de Moraes, and beside the English version entitled *The Girl from Ipanema* created by the North American versionist Norman Gimble for matters of comparison and further analysis.

Garota de Ipanema (Tom Jobim / Vinicius de Moraes)	The Girl from Ipanema (Tom Jobim / Vinicius de Moraes) Versionist: Norman Gimble
Olha que coisa mais linda Mais cheia de graça É ela, menina que vem e que passa Num doce balanço caminho do mar	Tall and tan and young and lovely The girl from Ipanema goes walking And when she passes Each one she passes goes "ahhh"
Moça do corpo dourado Do sol de Ipanema O seu balançado é mais que um poema É a coisa mais linda que eu já vi passar	When she walks, she's like a samba That swings so cool and sways so gentle That when she passes Each one she passes goes "ahhh"
Ah, por que estou tão sozinho? Ah, por que tudo é tão triste? Ah, a beleza que existe A beleza que não é só minha Que também passa sozinha	Oh, but I watch her so sadly How can I tell her I love her? Yes, I would give my heart gladly But each day when she walks to the sea She looks straight ahead, not at me
Ah, se ela soubesse Que quando ela passa O mundo inteirinho se enche de graça E fica mais lindo por causa do amor Por causa do amor Por causa do amor	Tall and tan and young and lovely The girl from Ipanema goes walking And when she passes, I smile But she doesn't see She just doesn't see No, she doesn't see

Source: <https://www.jobim.org/jobim/handle/2010/10407>

Starting by the title of the song, we can observe that it is the only time where the versionist Norman Gimble chose to use literal translation: *The girl from Ipanema* is the exact counterpart of the original title *Garota de Ipanema* in Portuguese. In opposite to Vinicius de

Moraes' source text, Gimbel decided to use the words of the song title in the lyrics to refer to its inspiring muse. Moraes only refers to her as *menina* (which is a synonym of *garota*) — girl in English, and *moça* — which means young lady or even a maiden, but he doesn't mention where she is from. The word 'Ipanema' is only used by Moraes to mention that the girl has a tanned body due to the sun of Ipanema (referring to the famous beach of Rio de Janeiro). So, the expression *Garota de Ipanema* altogether is absent from the original lyrics.

The female figure is the core theme of both lyrics. There is a man (the persona) who is fascinated by this girl, and that observes her when she passes on her way to the beach. One of the main aspects worth to start the analysis is the different ways that the observer describes the girl's image in each lyric. In the original song, we can conclude that the girl is young because, as mentioned above, the author uses the words *menina* and *moça* to refer to her. Both words in Portuguese are related to a young age, and at no point she is referred to as a woman. It is easier to get the same conclusion in the English version, because Gimbel is more direct by using the word 'young' to describe the girl in the first verse of the song. Throughout the lyrics he only uses the word 'girl' to refer to her, otherwise we can only find the personal pronoun 'she'.

The deviation presented in the set of expressions and adjectives used to describe the girl's physical appearance in the English version may be related to the cultural difference and the distinct concept of beauty between Brazil and the United States of the 1960's. By the time the song was released in Brazil in 1962 and two years later first recorded with lyrics in the USA, the true identity of the inspiring muse had not been yet revealed by the Brazilian authors. It was only in an interview in 1965 that Vinicius de Moraes mentioned the name of Heloísa Pinheiro as the actual 'girl from Ipanema'. So, when Gimbel made his version of the song, he didn't know how the girl really resembled. He had to use his imagination to express through words how beautiful the girl was to the North American audience.

Except from the verse where Moraes says that the girl has a tanned body (*corpo dourado*), the other lines are only related to her beauty, without mentioning physical attributes such as the color of her eyes, texture of her hair or her body shape. The author lets the audience imagine how such features would be like. We only know by the verses "*Olha que coisa mais linda / Mais cheia de graça*" that the girl is the prettiest thing and the most graceful to the observer. However, in the English version, we have the physical attributes of the girl put unambiguously in the first verse of the song: "Tall and tan and young and lovely". Gimbel decided to include the adjective tall to describe the girl's appearance, despite no mention of it by Moraes. Probably, this is a case of domestication in translation which might reflect the North

American ideal of beauty at the time — matter of fact, most international top models are tall women since then.

Another remarkable aspect of the song is the depiction of the way the girl walks when she cruises past the observer towards the beach and the consequences of this act. In the first stanza of the Brazilian song, the persona from his observation spot reports that the girl comes and passes by in a sweet swing on her way to the sea (*“É ela, menina que vem e que passa / Num doce balanço caminho do mar”*). In English, these verses were *transcreated* as “The girl from Ipanema goes walking / And when she passes / Each one she passes goes ahhh”. But further on, in the second stanza, Gimbel brings the sense of Moraes’ verses back affirming that “When she walks, she’s like a samba / That swings so cool and sways so gentle”. We can observe here the use of the system of compensation in translation, when you may lose something in a certain point, but you regain it later. Noteworthy to mention that the line where Gimbel compares the girl’s walk to a samba is also a compensation to another verse in the source lyrics which says that the girl’s swing is more than a poem (*“o seu balançado é mais que um poema”*). While Moraes compares the girl’s walk to a poem — and he masters the subject —, Gimbel preferred to use the metaphor of a samba. Although the sense of the verse was kept, and besides the aspect of singability, Gimbel’s decision probably leans on the idea of including a stereotypical view of Brazilian culture or even an exoticism that would be familiar to the North American audience. Additionally, it can also be seen as foreignization in translation, which is used to keep some aspect of the source text to emphasize its origin and foreignness.

Therefore, assuming that within the transcreation process of a singable song there is a certain flexibility and room for deviations, we can notice that there is a high level of correlation between the original song and its English version regarding the characteristics of the female figure portrayed on both, as it can be seen in the following table:

Source text	Transcreation text
<i>Menina / moça</i>	Girl / young
<i>Linda / cheia de graça / beleza</i>	Lovely
<i>Corpo dourado</i>	Tan
<i>Doce balanço</i>	Swings so cool / sways so gentle
<i>Seu balançado é mais que um poema</i>	When she walks, she’s like a samba

Regarding the effect caused by the girl when she passes by the man who observes her, it is possible to identify some divergences, but without huge losses in the sense of the lyrics. In *Garota de Ipanema*, the effect caused by the passing girl is enormous because, after having observed the girl, the persona declares that the entire world is filled with grace and gets more beautiful because of the love (“*O mundo inteirinho se enche de graça / E fica mais lindo por causa do amor*”). So, the girl’s impact is not only restricted to the man’s feelings, but to all the environment surrounding them. It is not clear though if the mentioned love is the one that he might feel for her, or if it is a kind of love that emanates from the girl and overwhelms everyone and everything while she smoothly strolls on her pathway to the beach. In another manner, the versionist couldn’t convey the same poetical language on this matter to the English lyrics. The first stanza of the transcreation brings the lines “And when she passes / each one she passes goes ahhh” to suggest how the people react watching the girl. We can relate this choice to the aspect of singability because the onomatopoeia “ahhh” used by Gimble resembles the sound of the Portuguese words *mar* (sea) and *passar* (pass) contained on the original verses. Furthermore, what was supposed to be the correlative to the original verses “*O mundo inteirinho se enche de graça / E fica mais lindo por causa do amor*” in the last stanza of the song turned out to have a different sense in the English version. Gimble decided to write the following words: “The girl from Ipanema goes walking / And when she passes, I smile / But she doesn’t see”. Here we can observe a loss in the romantic aspect of the song to highlight in a practical way how the girl overlooks the man.

The characteristics of the male figure of the song are also similar in both texts. Either Moraes or Gimble portrayed the observer as a lonely and melancholic man who is insecure to talk to the girl he is in love with, but still has a positive and romantic view about life. In the original song, the man only observes the girl from a far distance, there is no sort of interaction between them. After had observed the girl passing by, he questions himself about his loneliness and miserable condition (*Ah, por que estou tão sozinho? / Ah, por que tudo é tão triste?*). And further, in the last stanza, he wonders what would happen if the girl knew the impact she causes not only on him but in the entire world when she goes by (*Ah, se ela soubesse / Que quando ela passa / O mundo inteirinho se enche de graça / E fica mais lindo por causa do amor*). The persona *transcreated* by Gimble does not question himself about being lonely or sad but conveys this idea describing the way he watches the girl — “Oh, but I watch her so sadly / How can I tell her I love her?”. And the main difference is that in the English version the man attempts timidly to interact with the girl but without success as we can see in the following

verses: “Yes, I would give my heart gladly / But each day when she walks to the sea / She looks straight ahead, not at me / ... And when she passes, I smile / But she doesn’t see”.

At this point of the analysis section, we are going to briefly examine some musical aspects of the original song compared to its English version based on the study of Natanael Rocha (2013) about some of the translations of *Garota de Ipanema* to other languages.

According to Rocha (2013), *Garota de Ipanema* was originally composed in duple meter (2/4), but it was first recorded in quadruple meter (4/4) and in F major key. The song has only two parts with two distinct melodic bases (A and B) which are repeated alternately. Stanzas I, II and IV are sung in melodic basis A and stanza III is sung in melodic basis B. The parts of the song are repeated in the following sequence: A, A, B, A, B. The English version retained all these features as the original. However, there are some differences regarding the number of notes. If we get the melodic basis A, for example, the original song has 39 musical notes and 37 poetic syllables. Whereas in Gimbel’s version there are 34 musical notes and 30 poetic syllables. This issue is related to the singability criterion of Low’s Pentathlon Principle, considering that Gimbel used longer tempos and, consequently, a lower number of notes in the melody. This way, he respected the rhythm and adapted the singability, using fewer poetic syllables for that. For a better understanding of this adaptation, we can analyze the first musical measure of the song. There are six played notes in the original (G–G–E–E–E–D), which are accompanied by six poetic syllables on the lyrics as illustrated in the following figure:



Source: Rocha, 2013.

For the same measure, the English version has only four played notes (G–E–E–D) and four poetic syllables according to the figure below:



Source: Rocha, 2013.

Even though the musical prosody was retained, it is impractical to try to sing the original lyrics with the adapted melody of the English version (and vice-versa) because they became unmatched considering the Low's criteria of singability and naturalness.

Generally, the rhythm of bossa nova songs is in the tempo moderato, which allows them to be performed within 108 and 120 beats per minute (bpm). This aspect was not changed in the English version of *Garota de Ipanema* (Rocha, 2013).

Regarding the rhyme criterion, we can observe that there was a quality loss in the adaptation of the original verses to the English language. Despite the differences in the phonetics system of Portuguese and English and the flexibility for deviation on transcreation, Gimbel chose some words that originated poor rhymes. In the original song there are a total of seven rhyming couplets: *graça/passa*, *linda/menina*, *dourado/balançado*, *mar/passar*, *triste/existe*, *minha/sozinha*, *passa/graça*. Clearly Gimbel did not follow the original rhyming scheme by creating the following couplets: lovely/walking, passes/passes, ahhh/ahhh, sadly/gadly, sea/me. Except for the latter, the other four pairs can be considered poor rhymes, including two of them that use exactly the same words.

In this final paper, for the matter of comparison, we decided to use the original lyrics of *Garota de Ipanema* written by Vinicius de Moares and the first English version of *The Girl from Ipanema* transcreated by Norman Gimbel that were shown previously. Nevertheless, the recording in English that introduced the song to North American audience and became extremely popular worldwide was the one from the 1964 album *Getz/Gilberto* which presented some adaptations on the lyrics to be sung by a woman — Astrud Gilberto. Then, where the male figure was represented, the personal pronoun 'I' was replaced by 'he'. This way, the female singer only narrated the song story without being part of it. This adaption on the lyrics for a female singer is illustrated in the table below.

Regular English version	English version adapted for a female singer
Oh, but I watch her so sadly How can I tell her I love her? Yes, I would give my heart gladly But each day when she walks to the sea She looks straight ahead, not at me ... And when she passes, I smile But she doesn't see	Oh, but he watches so sadly How can he tell her he loves her? Yes, he would give his heart gladly But each day when she walks to the sea She looks straight ahead, not at he ... And when she passes, he smiles But she doesn't see

The referred changes are related to the criteria of naturalness, in which is likely to think that a woman would feel more comfortable and connected to the lyrics' message in singing this adapted version. We can notice by the transcription of the lyrics in the table that with the replacement of the pronoun 'I' for 'he' other changes were also necessary. In the first verse, the verb 'watch' was conjugated to the third person of the Simple Present becoming 'watches'; due to singability issues the pronoun 'her' was removed, but without loss in the sense. The verb 'love' in the second verse was also conjugated to the form of 'loves', and the following verse had the pronoun 'my' changed to 'his'. In the verse "she looks straight ahead, not at he" the criterion of singability was prioritized instead of naturalness because the grammatically correct pronoun should be "him". However, it doesn't have the same connection in rhyme with the word 'sea' in the end of the previous verse. In the last stanza, there is also a change in the verb 'smile' to 'smiles'.

The English version adapted for a female singer was performed countless times and recorded by remarkable singers such as Ella Fitzgerald and Diana Krall with even more changes, including the title which became *The Boy from Ipanema*. Another interesting aspect that underlines the greater influence of North American culture is the fact that the versions of *Garota de Ipanema* in French, Italian and German were based on the lyrics of *The Girl from Ipanema*, which characterizes an indirect translation, even though the two priors share the same Latin origin as the Portuguese language.

4 FINAL CONSIDERATIONS

For this final paper, we aimed to bring to discussion within the Academy one aspect of Brazilian culture that has achieved most success and appreciation worldwide — Bossa Nova. Like in many other countries since the post-World War II period, Brazil has been highly influenced by anglophone artists, even more than Spanish language manifestations stemmed from all the South American countries that surround us. Being the sole country in America to speak Portuguese, the language could be a barrier in terms of foreign communication. This might be one reason why the cultural exchange has been much stronger from North America towards the South than the other way around, besides the evident role of the economic power. And that is the intersection point where translation and Brazilian culture interweave. This work was written in English about aspects of Brazilian culture, attesting in English, the current lingua franca of the world, the artistic power of the Portuguese language.

Translation studies are not novelty in academic research, but song translation is. Most works related to translation and music found while researching for the present paper were about opera, theater musicals, songs from animation movies, and a few about translation of popular songs from English to other languages. The papers we came across which analyzed translation of songs from Portuguese to other languages were scarce. So, this final paper is also an attempt to humbly contribute to the creation of a broad corpus on the subject.

One of the aims of this monography was to describe the context in which Bossa Nova arose as a musical rhythm in Brazil of the 1950's and its pathway to international success. More than that, it was possible to emphasize the importance of Bossa Nova as an innovative movement of renovation of Brazilian music. Throughout this research we could attest that, despite the previous foreign recognition of Carmem Miranda's work and Ary Barroso's *Aquarela do Brasil*, Bossa Nova is the Brazilian cultural manifestation that has been the most accepted, appreciated, and influential abroad until today, especially in North America, Europe, and Japan.

The second objective was to examine the concept of transcreation and relate it to the creation process of the English language version of *Garota de Ipanema*. While researching translation studies to fulfill the literature review section we could notice the lack of material approaching singable song translation in particular. The background of the translation studies of creative texts are most related to poetry, which even shares some features with songs like lyricism and musicality, but not entirely. However, the comparison is valid when we think of

poetry as verbal text, written with the purpose to be declaimed, just like a song is composed to be sung.

Concerning the translation of creative texts, essayists as Ezra Pound, Roman Jakobson, and Walter Benjamin agree with the idea of a certain liberty for the original text to be recreated by the translator in order to convey its sense and meaning in the target language. Converging with this understanding, Haroldo de Campos coined the concept of *transcreation*, which is concluded to be the most appropriate manner to approach the task of creative text translation. It was bearing the *transcreation* concept in mind — that is, being flexible and giving room for deviations without great loss — that we analyzed the similarities and differences between *Garota de Ipanema* and *The Girl from Ipanema*. This way, we could identify that the title is the only part where literal translation was applied. All the other lines were *transcreated* by versionist Norman Gimbel who made good use of some freedom in word choices and expression adaptations to domesticate the song to the North American audience.

Finally, the last aim was to analyze which criteria of Peter Low's Pentathlon Principle were prioritized in the production of the English language version of *Garota de Ipanema*. The literature review for this paper allowed us to recognize Low as one of the few scholars that has devoted his time to singable song translation studies and has done it with excellence. The content of his work is clear, relevant, and useful for anyone interested in the subject. The five criteria of his Pentathlon Principle — singability, naturalness, rhythm, rhyme, and sense — were paramount for the conduction of the analysis proposed in this paper. With the understanding of them it was clearer to identify the choices made by the versionists in *The Girl from Ipanema*. Above all, the sense of the original lyrics was preserved. The rhythm of the song was retained, although some slight changes in the number of notes and poetic syllables were necessary. The rhyme scheme was not followed by Norman Gimbel, which can be considered a loss in comparison to the original. It can also be related to the singability aspect, considering the differences in the phonetic system between Portuguese and English. As the main purpose of Gimbel's version was to be sung, it is natural that the singability was prioritized. What leads us to the naturalness criterion, that played an important role in the analyzed song. There is a substantial adaptation in the English version when it is sung by a woman, especially in the pronouns and verb conjugation. Nevertheless, the present analysis indicates that the lyrics in English were not necessarily altered because they were misunderstood by the North American versionist (also considering that Tom Jobim, one of the original authors, was present during the recreation process). Some culturally specific elements simply would not make sense to non-Brazilian audiences and therefore turned out to be untranslatable, regardless of the

knowledgeability of the translator. So, according to Low's Pentathlon Principle we can say that *The Girl from Ipanema* is a successful transcreation because it manages to balance properly the five criteria.

In conclusion, we can affirm that the transcreation of *Garota de Ipanema* to the English language was not harmful to the original lyrics or to Brazilian culture as some conservative people may think (including the author of these lines before producing this paper). In the opposite, it contributed decisively to a broader propagation of Brazilian culture worldwide. Undoubtedly, an even greater appreciation of Bossa Nova was possible due to the power of music translation. *The Girl from Ipanema* and many other Bossa Nova songs translated to English and other languages worked as a catalyst taking Brazilian music to places that were never imagined before.

Apart from time constraints due to the harsh reality of many Brazilian undergraduate students that have to divide their time between university and work, the limitations of this final paper concerns to the lack of published academic studies on singable song translation. Likewise, the character of the work requested makes us believe that a qualitative analysis would be more appropriate than a quantitative one. Therefore, further research can be done on the topic featuring more songs and their translations, or maybe translations in other languages of the same song. Gender issues can be explored in the more radical adaptation *The Boy from Ipanema* made under the perspective of a woman. The present work might also serve as a starting point for future studies that could analyze in a deeper way how much of Bossa Nova distinctive aspects were preserved in the English version of its most renowned songs in the United States.

REFERENCES

- ANTUNES, Leonardo. Tradução como derivação estética e a percepção dos clássicos. *In*: NEUMANN, Gerson Roberto; RICHTER, Cintea; DAUDT, Mariana Ingenfritz (Orgs.). **Literatura comparada: ciências humanas, cultura, tecnologia**. Porto Alegre: Class, 2021.
- BOTELHO, Claudio. Entrevista com Claudio Botelho. *In*: MEINBERG, Adriana Fiuza (Org.). **Tradução e Comunicação: Revista brasileira de tradutores**, Nº 26, p. 143 – 148. São Paulo: Anhanguera Educacional Ltda., 2013.
- CABRAL, Sergio. **Antônio Carlos Jobim: Uma Biografia**. Rio de Janeiro: Lumiar Editora, 1997.
- CAMPOS, Haroldo de. **Da transcrição poética e semiótica da operação tradutora**. Belo Horizonte: Fale/UFGM, 2011.
- CAMPOS, Haroldo de. Da tradução como criação e como crítica. *In*: TÁPIA, Marcelo; NÓBREGA, Thelma (Orgs.). **Haroldo de Campos: transcrição**. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2013. p. 1-18.
- CANDIDO, Antônio. Um poema de Vinicius de Moraes. *In*: MORAES, Vinicius de. **Poemas, sonetos e baladas e Pátria minha**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2008. p. 159-162.
- CASTELLO, José. Um poeta bem acompanhado. *In*: MORAES, Vinicius de. **Livro de Letras**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2015. p. 225-284.
- CASTRO, Ruy. **Chega de Saudade: A História e as Histórias da Bossa Nova**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 1990.
- COSTA E SILVA, Paulo da. Da poesia à canção: notas sobre o Vinicius de Moraes letrista. *In*: MORAES, Vinicius de. **Livro de Letras**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2015. p. 209-219.
- FERRAZ, Eucanaã. Uma reta ascendente para o infinito. *In*: MORAES, Vinicius de. **Livro de Letras**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2015. p. 285-315.
- FLORES, Guilherme G.; GONÇALVES, Rodrigo T. **Algo Infiel: Corpo Performance Tradução**. São Paulo: Cultura e Barbárie Editora, 2017.
- FRANZON, Johan. Choices in Song Translation: Singability in print, subtitles and sung performance. **The Translator**, Manchester: St. Jerome, Vol. 14, no. 2, 2008.
- GORLÉE, Dinda L. (Ed.). **Song and Significance: Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation**. New York: Amsterdam & New York Rodopi, 2005.
- GUERINI, A.; COSTA, W. C.; HOMEM DE MELLO, S. **Haroldo de Campos, tradutor e traduzido**. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2019.
- HOMEM, Wagner; DE LA ROSA, Bruno. **Vinicius de Moraes: Histórias de canções**. São Paulo: Leya, 2013.

HOMEM, Wagner; OLIVEIRA, Luiz Roberto. **Tom Jobim: Histórias de canções**. São Paulo: Leya, 2012.

International Olympic Committee. **Modern Pentathlon**. Available in <https://olympics.com/en/sports/modern-pentathlon/>. Accessed on Jul 8th, 2023.

LOW, Peter. Singable Translations of songs. **Perspectives: Studies in Translatology**, 11 (2), 2003, p. 87-103.

LOW, Peter. The Pentathlon Approach to Translating Songs. In: GORLÉE, Dinda (Ed.). **Song and Significance: Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation**. New York: Amsterdam & New York Rodopi, 2005, 185-212 p.

MILLIET, Sérgio. Outubro, 29. In: MORAES, Vinicius de. **Poemas, sonetos e baladas e Pátria minha**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2008. p. 153-158.

MORAES, Vinicius de. **Canção do Amor Demais**. Rio de Janeiro: Festa Discos, 1958.

MOTTA, Nelson. **101 canções que tocaram o Brasil**. Rio de Janeiro: Estação Brasil, 2016.

MELLO, Zuza Homem de. **Amoroso: Uma biografia de João Gilberto**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2021.

ROCHA, Natanael. **Olha que coisa mais linda: As traduções da canção ‘Garota de Ipanema’ em Inglês, Alemão, Francês e Italiano sob a Ótica do Sistema de Transitividade**. Dissertação (Mestrado) – Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, Centro de Comunicação e Expressão, Programa de Pós-Graduação em Estudos da Tradução, Florianópolis: Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, 2013.

SEVERIANO, Jairo. **Uma história da música popular brasileira: Das origens à modernidade**. São Paulo: Editora 34, 2008.

SUSAN-SARAJEVA, S. Translation and Music: Changing Perspectives, Frameworks and Significance. **The Translator**, vol. 14, no. 2, 2008, 187-200 p.

The Harvard Gazette. **New Harvard study establishes music is universal**. Available in <https://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2019/11/new-harvard-study-establishes-music-is-universal/>. Accessed on Jul 8th 2023.

WISNIK, José Miguel. A balada do poeta príndigo. In: MORAES, Vinicius de. **Poemas, sonetos e baladas e Pátria minha**. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2008. p. 143-150.



Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio Grande do Sul
Pró-Reitoria de Graduação
Av. Ipiranga, 6681 - Prédio 1 - 3º. andar
Porto Alegre - RS - Brasil
Fone: (51) 3320-3500 - Fax: (51) 3339-1564
E-mail: prograd@pucrs.br
Site: www.pucrs.br